
Rt Hon Alun Cairns MP
Secretary of State for Wales

By Email

19th January 2018

Dear Alun

Swansea Bay Tidal Lagoon

We met in Cardiff Bay last year when I kicked off discussion on behalf of a group of Environmental NGOs regarding the future of European Directives. Since then we have seen you discuss on Television the problems associated with the proposed lagoon.

You would be right to expect an NGO with an interest in migratory fisheries to take a keen interest in the outcome of government deliberations and clearly we are alarmed at the prospect of any lagoon which would damage our already fragile fish stocks. We include salmon, sea trout, eels, lamprey and shad: all are in danger and most of which have significant EU designations.

However, we feel it might be helpful to reiterate **all** the flaws in the case for the lagoon as seen from the coalface:

- The economic cost of lagoon power cf offshore wind places it at a significant disadvantage and merely spreading the cost over a longer period could be very misleading particularly if the scheme underperforms as suggested ahead.
- There is significant uncertainty about the changes that would occur once constructed. There is a risk of sediment retention within the lagoon. True, it could be dredged as frequently occurs elsewhere in the Bristol channel but the additional cost or the consequential reduction in output could render the project even less economic than present estimates suggest.
- Quarrying is a hugely destructive process and the lagoon construction will result in a very significant amount of carbon dioxide going into the atmosphere.
- Advances in electricity 'storage' bring cheaper forms of green generation much more into the front line of generation.
- We cannot see how a marine licence can be granted given the current constraints and the poor ('fake?') modelling of fish movements, unless via a significant derogation of commitment to environmental legislation takes place

Ffon: 07812118065 ebost: stephen@afonyddcumru.org www.afonyddcymru.org

- Lastly our migratory fish species plus the resident and juvenile sea fish species are important and are likely to be significantly damaged or threatened with extinction.

Your government is well supported in resisting this flawed scheme.

With best wishes

Yours sincerely

A handwritten signature in black ink that reads "Stephen". The signature is written in a cursive style with a long horizontal stroke at the bottom.

Dr Stephen Marsh-Smith OBE
CEO Afonydd Cymru